IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS DALLAS DIVISION

GAYLA SMITH,	§	
	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
V.	§	C.A. NO.: 3:16-cv-374
	§	
RICHARD WASHINGTON,	§	
CELADON TRUCKING SERVICES, INC.	§	
and JASON SMITH	§	
	§	
Defendants.	§	

DEFENDANT'S NOTICE OF REMOVAL

Defendant, Celadon Trucking Services, Inc. files this Notice of Removal pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441, *et seq.*, this civil action is removed from the 443rd Judicial District Court, in Ellis County, Texas, where this matter was pending under Cause No. 92974, in a matter styled, *Gayla Smith v. Richard Washington, Celadon Trucking Services, Inc. and Jason Smith.*

II. NATURE OF SUIT

2. Plaintiff's lawsuit arises from an automobile collision. Plaintiff seeks actual damages, pain and suffering, mental anguish, physical impairment, past and future loss of earnings, past and future disfigurement, past and future medical expenses, and exemplary damages. *See* Plaintiff's Original Petition at *Tab 1*.

III. TIMELINESS OF REMOVAL

- 3. Plaintiff commenced this lawsuit by filing her Original Petition on January 15, 2016. Plaintiff's Petition asserts an amount in controversy of over seventy-five thousand dollars (\$75,000.00).
- 4. Thus, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b)(3), this Notice of Removal is timely filed within thirty (30) days after receipt of information from which it may first be ascertained that the case is one which is or has become removable.

IV. BASIS FOR REMOVAL JURISDICTION

5. Removal is proper under 28 U.S.C. §§1441 and 1332(a) because there is a complete diversity of citizenship between Plaintiff and the properly-named Defendants in this lawsuit and the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000.00. No current properly joined Defendant is a citizen of Texas.

A. Proper Parties

- 6. Plaintiff is and was at the time of filing of this action, a citizen of Texas.
- 7. Defendant Celadon Trucking Services, Inc. is now, and was at the time of the filing of this action, a New Jersey corporation that is headquartered and has its principal place of business in Indianapolis, Indiana.
- 8. Defendant Richard Washington is now, and was at the time of the filing of this action, a citizen of Arkansas.
- 9. Defendant Jason Smith, the husband of Plaintiff, is a resident of Texas.

- 10. If a Defendant has been fraudulently or improperly joined, that defendant is disregarded for purposes of determining diversity. *See Cantor v. Wachovia Mortgage, FSB*, 641 F.Supp. 2d, 602, 605 (N.D.Tex.2009) (citing *Smallwood v. Illinois Cent. R.R. Co.*, 385 F.3d 568, 572 (5th Cir. 2004). "Fraudulent or improper joinder is established when the removing party meets the heavy burden of showing: (1) there was actual fraud in pleading the jurisdictional facts; or (2) the plaintiff is unable to establish a cause of action against the non-diverse defendant under state law." *Id.*
- 11. Although Defendant Jason Smith is a non-diverse party, he has been improperly joined in this lawsuit to defeat diversity jurisdiction. Specifically, Plaintiff's pleadings against Defendant Jason Smith fail to establish a cause of action against him under state law.
- 12. To prove improper joinder, a Defendant must show there is no reasonable basis for predicting that state law might impose liability against any non-diverse Defendant. *See Travis v. Irby*, 326 F.3d 644, 647 (5th Cir. 2003). Instead, the court must determine whether plaintiff might possibly prevail. *See Staples v. Merck & Co.*, 270 F.Supp.2d 833, 837 (N.D. Tex. 2003). The court uses a standard to that employed for motions to dismiss under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) in order to determine whether a "reasonable basis" for liability exists. *Id.* A "mere theoretical possibility" of recovery under state law does not suffice to preclude removal. *See Badon v. RJR Nabisco, Inc.*, 236 F.3d 282, 286 (5th Cir. 2000).
- 13. In this case, taking all factual assertions contained in Plaintiff's pleadings in Plaintiff's favor, there is nothing more than a mere theoretical possibility that Plaintiff could prevail in her claims against Defendant Jason Smith.
- 14. Specifically, Plaintiff's Petition asserts that Plaintiff's claims relate to an automobile accident which took place on January 30, 2014. With regard to specific allegations and assertions related to Defendant Jason Smith, Plaintiff's Petition states or asserts the following:

- Plaintiff Gayla Smith was a passenger in a vehicle driven by Jason Smith and stopped at the stop light on Highway 77 when suddenly and without warning, Defendant Richard Washington, operating a (sic) 18-wheeler...collided with Plaintiff's vehicle.
- This accident was investigated by Officer William Kimsey with the Waxahachie Police Department who determined Defendant Richard Washington failed to properly turn his vehicle at the time of this incident.
- POTENTIAL NEGLIGENCE OF DEFENDANT JASON SMITH: On or about January 30, 2014, Defendant Jason Smith may have been negligent in failing to pay attention to the roadway and/or failing to take proper evasive action. Any negligence of Defendant Jason Smith may have been a much smaller proximate cause of the injuries and permanent damages suffered by Plaintiff.
- 15. A review of Plaintiff's Petition shows that Plaintiff has made clear, direct, and specific assertions of negligence against both Defendant Celadon and Defendant Washington. However, Plaintiff does not even assert that her husband, Defendant Smith, was negligent. She only states that he *may have been negligent*. Moreover, Plaintiff's Petition contains no facts supporting any element of negligence as to Defendant Jason Smith. *See Cantor*, 641 F.Supp. 2d at 612, citing *Great Plains Trust Co. v. Morgan Stanley Dean Witter & Co.*, 313 F.3d 305, 312 (5th Cir. 2002) ("When Plaintiffs make general allegations and fail to support them with specific, underlying facts, they have not established a reasonable basis for the Court to predict that relief may be granted).
- 16. A district court may pierce the pleadings and conduct a summary inquiry into the propriety of joinder if discrete facts have been omitted. *See Smallwood*, 395 F.3d at 573. To the extent the Court wishes to go beyond the Plaintiff's pleadings, Defendant attaches hereto as (*See Exhibit A*) a true and correct copy of the Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report related to the incident involving Plaintiff. The report shows that the investigating officer did not attribute any actions of Defendant Jason Smith as having contributed to this collision. *See Travis*, 326 F.3d at 648-49.

17. Based on the foregoing, Defendant Jason Smith's joinder in this lawsuit should be disregarded for purposes of determining subject matter jurisdiction.

B. Amount in Controversy

18. The amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000.00, exclusive of interest and costs. Plaintiff seeks actual damages, pain and suffering, mental anguish, physical impairment, past and future loss of earnings, past and future medical expenses, and exemplary damages. Plaintiff's Petition asserts Plaintiff is seeking monetary relief in excess of \$200,000.00. Accordingly, it is "facially apparent" that Plaintiff's claims likely exceed \$75,000.00, which is all that is required to satisfy the amount-in-controversy requirement. *See Allen v. R&H Oil & Gas Co.*, 63 F.3d 1326, 1335 (5th Cir. 1995).

V. NOTICE IS PROCEDURALLY CORRECT

19. Defendant has attached to this Notice of Removal the documents currently available to Defendant, as required by 28 U.S.C. § 1446(a) and Local Rule 81 as follows:

A: Index of all attachments, including a copy of the state-court docket sheet and a copy of each document filed in the State Court Action. Defendant has submitted a request to the district clerk of Ellis County and will supplement this notice of removal as soon as the complete file is received from the state court (*See Exhibit B*). Defendant attaches hereto the documents currently in its possession.

- B: All executed process in the State Court Action; and
- C: List of all counsel, including addresses, telephone numbers and parties represented.
- 20. This action may be removed to this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b) because no properly joined and served Defendant is a citizen of Texas, the state in which the action was brought. This action is removable to this Court because this United States District Court and Division embraces the place where the State Court Action was pending. 28 U.S.C. §§124(a)(1), 1441(a).

21. In accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 1446(d), written notice of filing of this Notice of Removal will be given to all parties and to the Clerk of the 443rd Judicial District Court in Ellis County, Texas.

DATED: February 10, 2016

Respectfully Submitted,

GAUNTT, KOEN, BINNEY, WOODALL & KIDD, LLP

/s/ Robert J. Collins

KARL W. KOEN

State Bar No.: 11652275 karl.koen@gkbwklaw.com

ROBERT J. COLLINS

State Bar No.: 24031970 <u>robert.collins@gkbwklaw.com</u>

14643 Dallas Parkway, Suite 500 Dallas, Texas 75254 972-630-4620 – Telephone 972-630-4669 – Facsimile

ATTORNEY FOR DEFENDANT CELADON TRUCKING SERVICES, INC.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document was forwarded to the following counsel of record pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, as indicated below, on this the 10th day of February, 2016.

Via Facsimile # (972) 938-7676

Mr. Stephen Daniel Jenkins & Jenkins 516 West Main Street Waxahachie, Texas 75165

/s/ Robert J. Collins

ROBERT J. COLLINS

Case 3:16-cv-00374-G Document 1 Filed 02/10/16 Page 8 of 12 PageID 8 Law Enforcement and TxDOT Use ONLY Total Total TxDOT 13418280.1 X CMV SCHOOL BUS RAILROAD MAB SUPPLEMENT SCHOOL ZONE Units Crash ID /2013310535 Prans Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report (Form CR-3 1/1/2010) Mail to: Texas Department of Transportation, Crash Records, P.O. Box 149349, Austin, TX 78714. Questions? Call (512) 486-5780 Page 1 of 4 Refer to Attached Code Sheet for Numbered Fields ⇒=These fields are required on all additional sheats submitted for this crash (ex.: additional vehicles, occupants, injured, etc.). ★ Crash Time Case Crash Date (MM/DD/YYYY) (24HRMM) Use 2013-30172 Outside * City * County L. City Limit Name MARSHALL Name In your opinion, did this crash result in at least 🗷 Yos Latitude Longitude \$1,000 damage to any one person's property? No (decimal degrees) (decimal degrees) ROAD ON WHICH CRASH OCCURRED *1 Rdwy. 4 Street 2 Rdwy. 3 Street **★Street** Block Num, 1300 United Flight Ninety Three Suffix Part Prefix Namo Sys. Speed Const. Yes Workers Yes Street Crash Occurred on a Private Drive or Toll Road/ Toll Lane Limit 20 Zone X No Present X No Road/Private Property/Parking Lot Desc. INTERSECTING ROAD, OR IF CRASH NOT AT INTERSECTION, NEAREST INTERSECTING ROAD OR REFERENCE MARKER Yos 1 Rdwy. 2 Rdwy. 3 Street 4 Strest Hwy. Block Suffix ST Profix Part Num. 1700 x No Sys. Num. Name Poplar X FT 3 Dir. from Int. Reference RRX Distance from Int. Street MI or Ref. Marker N Marker Num. or Rof. Marker Unil 5 Unit Parked Hiland LP <u> 1</u>2 Vahicle VIN 1 F M P U 1 1 7 L 19 14 L , A 3 | 5 | 8 | 9 Num. DG4D398 State TX Num Run Desc. 1 Pol., Fire, EMS on 7 Body Vch. 6 Veh. Veh. FORD EXPEDITION Emergency (Explain In Narrative if checked) Model (UTILITY) Color GRN Make FORD Style Year 9 DL 11 DL DOB DL/ID 10 CDL 8 DL/ID DL/ID Num. 09688876 End. 96 Rest. 96 State TX Class C Type Address (Street, 151 Berea One A Jefferson, TX 75670 City, State, ZIP) 8 Rest 520 Eject 2 Name: Last, First, Middle 6 Sex 21 Sol. Enter Driver or Primary Person for this Unit on first line 49 2 1 Powell, Wanda Suc 1 7 2 N 7 W 2 1 1 97 N Powell, Addison Not Applicable - Alcohol and Drug Results are only reported for Driver/Primary Person for each Unit. x Owner Owner/Lesses Name & Address powell, Wanda Sug, 151 Berca One A Jefferson, TX 75670 Proof of X Yes Expired 28 Fin. Fin. Resp. Fin. Resp. Fin. Resp No Exempt Rosp. Typo 2 Namo Num. Nation Wide PPGM00227079564 Yes 27 Vehicle 27 Vehicle Vehicle Damage Raling 1 Damage Rating 2 Phone Num. 800-282-1446 1 R 1 P 1 7 2 1 Towod Towed Bv To Unit 5 Unit Parked Hit and VIN 3 H S D J S J R 6 C N I Run Num. 2042185 - Vehicle Desc. 1 State IN Num. Pol., Fire, EMS on Emergency (Explain in Narrative if checked) 7 Body Veh. Veh. Veh. 6 Veh. Model INTERNATIONAL TRUCKS Style TR Color WHI Make International Year 11 DI חו/ וכו 9 DL 10 CDL a DL/ID DIVID DOB Num P50088449304 End. 98 Class 98 Rest. 98 State FL (MM/DD/YYYY) Type Address (Street, 9125 McMillan LN Tampa, FL 33635 City, State, ZIP) Rest Name: Last, First, Middle 16 Sex Enter Driver or Primary Person for this Unit on first line Pina, Wilfred Donald N 63 W 97 97 97 Not Applicable - Alcohol and Drug Results are only reported for Driver/Primary Person for each Unit. Owner/Lessee Name & Address Coladon Trucking Service, 9503 E 33rd ST Indianapolis, IN Fin. Resp. Proof of Yes X Expired 26 Fin. Fin. Resp Num. Fin. Resp. No Exempt Resp. Type 2 **Mama** MC185116-self insured Regions Insurance 27 Vehicle 27 Vehicle Yes Damage Rating 1 Damage Rating 2 Phone Num. 479-684-5250 Towns Towed

EXHIBIT A

Law Enforcement and TxDOT Use ONLY. Case ID 2013-30172 TxDOT Crash ID 13418280.1/2013310535 Form CR-3 1/1/2010 Date of Death Time of Death Unit Prsn. Taken To Taken By Num. Num. (MM/DD/YYYY) (24HRMM) Unit Pran. Charge Citation/Reference Num. Num. Num. Owner's Address Damaged Property Other Than Vehicles Owner's Name Unit 28 Veh 29 Carrier Carrier TRANSPORTING x 10,001+ LBS. 9+ CAPACITY ID Num. 00261902 Num, HAZARDOUS MATERIAL Oper. ID Type Carriers Carrier's Primary Addr. 9503 E 33rd ST Indianapolis, IN Corp. Name Coladon Trucking Service **X** RGVW 30 Rdwy. 31 Vah. HazMat Yes 32 HazMat HazMat 32 HazMat HazMat GVWR 8 0 0 0 0 0 Released No Class Num. iD Num. Class Num. ID Num. Access Type ٥ RGVW RGVW 34 Trir. 34 Trir. Unit Unit 33 Cargo Trailer 2 Trailer 1 GVWR Body Style Num GVWR 0 | Type Num. Турв Total Total Sequence 35 Seq. 1 35 Seq. 2 35 Seq. 3 35 Seq. 4 Of Events Num. Axles Num. Tires 36 Contributing Factors (Investigator's Opinion) 37 Vehicle Defects (Investigator's Opinion) **Environmental and Roadway Conditions** S Cont Unit Num. May Have Contrib May Have Contrib. 44 Contributing Contributing Weather Entering Roadway Surface Treffic FACTOR Light Roadway Atlgnment Condition Cond. Cond. Roads Type Control 20 2 3 Field Diagram - Not to Scale Investigator's Namative Opinion of What Happened (Attach Additional Sheets if Necessary) Unit 1 was traveling north bound in the 1300 block of United Flight Ninety Three St. Unit 2 was backing out of the ABC Auto parts parking lot, which is in the 1300 block of United Flight Ninety Three. Unit 3, which was being towed by Unit 2, then collided with Unit 1. The driver of Unit 1 stated that she did not see Unit 2 backing out. The driver of Unit 2 stated that he did not see Unit 1 behind him. ABC Auto Parts parking lot 1300 Block United Flight Ninety Three Unit 1 Not To Scale Time Notified 0 (24HD How Report Date 0 8 / 0 8 / 2 0 1 3 (24HRMM) 1 7 1 1 9 Notified Dispatch (MM/DD/YYYY) Invest. Yes Investigator IĐ Num. 2260 Name (Printed) Adkinson, Michael Cory District *Agency MARSHALL POLICE DEPARTMENT

Area

A

Case 3:16-cv-00374-G Document 1 Filed 02/10/16 Page 10 of 12 PageID 10 Law Enforcement and TxDOT Use QNLY TxDOT 13418280.1 Num. Num. X CMV SCHOOL BUS RAILROAD MAB SUPPLEMENT Crash ID /2013310535 SCHOOL ZONE Units Prans. Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report (Form CR-3 1/1/2010) Mail to: Texas Department of Transportation, Crash Records, P.O. Box 149349, Austin, TX 78714. Questions? Call (512) 486-5780 Page _ 3_tof _ 4_1 Refer to Attached Code Shest for Numbered Fields *=These fields are required on all additional sheets submitted for this crash (ex.: additional vehicles, occupants, injured, etc.). * Crash Date *Crash Time Case Local 0 | 8 | / 0 | 8 | / 2 | 0 | 1 MM/DD/YYYY) ((Z4HRMM) 17 | 5 | 5 D 2013-30172 Use Outside *County #City City Limit Name MARSHALL Nome HARRISON Long!tude in your opinion, did this crash result in at least 🕱 Yes Latitude \$1,000 damage to any one person's property? No (decimal degrees) (decimal degrees) ROAD ON WHICH CRASH OCCURRED *1 Rdwy. 2 Rdwy. 3 Street 4 Street #Hwv Block *Street Num. 1300 United Flight Ninety Three Suffix Part Prefix Name Sys. Num Const. Yes Workers Yes Street Crash Occurred on a Private Drive or Speed Toll Road/ Toll Lane Limit 20 Zone X No Present X No Road/Private Property/Parking Lot Dasc. INTERSECTING ROAD, OR IF CRASH NOT AT INTERSECTION, NEAREST INTERSECTING ROAD OR REFERENCE MARKER Yes 1 Rdwy. Hwy. 2 Rdwy. Block 3 Streat 4 Street Suffix ST Prefix Name Poplar X No Sys. Num. 1700 Num FT 3 Dir, from Int. Reference Street RRX Distance from Int. Marker or Ref. Marker or Ref. Marker N MI. 200 Hit and LP Hoit 5 Unit Parked 10 VIN 1 | J | J | V | 5 | 3 | 2 | D | 1 | C | 1 16 2 10 6 11 17 Num. P314031 Num Desc. 6 Vehicle State IN Run Pol., Fire, EMS on Veh. 6 Veh. Veh. Veh. 7 Body Emergency (Explain in Namative if checked) Color WHI Model Style Make UNKNOWN Year 11 DL 8 DL/ID סועם DUID 9 OL 10 CDL Class €nd. Rest (MM/DD/YYYY) Num State Type Address (Street, City, State, ZIP) Restr 12 Prsn Name: Last, First, Middle Enter Driver or Primary Person for this Unit on first line Not Applicable - Alcohol and Drug Results are only reported for Driver/Primary Person for each Unit. Owner/Lessee Name & Address Coladon Trucking Service, 9503 E 33rd ST Indianapolis, IN Proof of Yes x Expired 26 Fin. Fin. Resp. Fin. Resp. Fin. Resp. No Exempt Resp. Type 2 Num. Namo MC185116-self insured Rogions Insurance 27 Vehicle Yes 27 Vehicle Vehicle Damage Rating 1 Damage Rating 2 Phone Num. 479-684-5250 BRJO Inventorled x No Toward Unit 5 Unit Parked Hit and LP LP MN Num Desc Vehicle Run State Num Pol., Fire, EMS on 7 Body Veh. 6 Veh Veh. Vah Emergency (Explain in Narrative if checked) Color Make Model Slyle Year 8 DL/ID DL/ID DL/ID 9 DL 10 CDL 11 DL DOB End. (MM/DD/YY State Class Num Туре Address (Street, City, State, ZIP) Name: Last, First, Middle 를 8 Enter Driver or Primary Person for this Unit on first line Not Applicable - Alcohol and Drug Results are only reported for Driver/Primary Person for each Unit. Owner Owner/Lessee Lessee Proof of Yes Expired Fin. Resp. Fin. Resp. 26 Fin. Fin. Resp. No Exempt Resp. Type Namo 27 Vehicle Yes 27 Vehicle Vehicle Fin. Reso. Damage Rating 2 Inventoried No Damage Rating 1 Phone Num Towad Towed B٧ Tο

Law Enforcement and TxDOT Use ONLY. TxDOT Crash ID 13418280.1/2013310535 Case ID 2013-30172 Form CR-3 1/1/2010 Time of Death Date of Death Unit Taken To Taken By (24HRMM) Num. Num. (MM/DD/YYYY) DISPOSITION OF NJURED! KILLED Unit Prsn. Charge Citation/Reference Num. Num. Num. Owner's Address Damaged Property Other Than Vehicles Owner's Name 29 Carrier Carrier 28 Veh. Unit TRANSPORTING 9+ CAPACITY 10,001+ LBS. HAZARDOUS MATERIAL ID Num. ID Type Oper. Num. Carrier's Carriers Согр. Nате Primary Addr RGVW Yes | 32 HazMat 32 HazMat HazMat 30 Rdwy. 31 Veh. HazMat HazMat Access ID Num. GVWR Released No Class Num. ID Num. Class Num. Туре RGVW 34 Trir. RGVW 33 Cargo Unit 34 Ydr. Unit Trailer 2 Trailer 1 Body Style Num □GVWR Туре Num. Турв Sequence 35 Seq. 1 Total Total 35 Soq. 4 35 Seq. 3 35 Seq. 2 Num. Axles Num. Tires Of Events Environmental and Roadway Conditions FACTORS CONDITIONS ON THE PROPERTY OF THE PROP 36 Contributing Factors (Investigator's Opinion) 37 Vehicle Defects (investigator's Opinion) May Have Contrib. Contributing May Have Contrib. Contributing 38 40 41 39 Entering Roadway Surface Treffic Weather Light Roadway Cond. Cond. Roads Type Alignment Condition Control Field Diagram - Not to Scale Investigator's Narretive Opinion of What Happened (Attach Additional Sheets If Necessary) Time Notified Report Date (MM//DD/YYYY) 0 | 8 | 1 | 0 | 8 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 3 Time Arrived How (24HRMM) 1 7 1 9 Notified Dispatch (24HR;MM) ID Invest, XYes Investigator Comp. 1No | ...

ORI
Num., t | x | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 Num. 2260 Comp. No Name (Printed) Adkinson, Michael Cory District/ *Agency MARSHALL POLICE DEPARTMENT Area A

Case 3:16-cv-00374-G Document 1 Filed 02/10/16 Page 11 of 12 PageID 11

GAUNTT KOEN BINNEY WOODALL & KIDD, LLP

SOLID PRINCIPLES | SOUND LEGAL SOLUTIONS

February 10, 2016

Via First Class Mail

Ms. Jackie Ray 443rd Judicial District 109 S. Jackson Waxahachie, Texas 75165

Re: Cause No.: 92974

Gayla Smith v. Richard Washington, Celadon Trucking Services, Inc. and Jason

Smith

DOI: 1-30-14

Our File No.: 7581.214150

Dear Ms. Reed:

Please allow this correspondence to serve as our request for a complete copy of the Court's file related to the above-referenced cause number. Our office is considering removing this matter to federal court and we need a copy of the entire contents in the Court's file including the case summary and docket sheet. Please contact me at the telephone number below or via email of the cost to complete such request and we will remit payment immediately.

I truly appreciate your assistance. Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (972) 630-4620.

Sincerely,

/s/ Melissa C. Shaffer

Melissa C. Shaffer Melissa.Shaffer@gkbwklaw.com

MCS/kt